

BOOK REVIEWS

Françoise Lionnet and Ronnie Scharfman, *Post-Colonial Conditions: Exiles, Migrations, and Nomadism* (published as *Yale French Studies*, n^o 82 & 83, 1993, 206pp. & 233pp.), ISSN 044 0078 / ISBN 0 300 05270 7.

These two volumes deal with identity and modernity in France and the Francophone world. The editors have attempted to go beyond narrow ethno-geographical categories and "expose the false universalism of the monolingual approach that tends to look at Francophone literatures from around the world without taking into consideration the oral traditions (be they Creole or Arabic, African or Caribbean) which post-colonial authors incorporate into their written French texts". *Post-Colonial Conditions*, therefore, offers some valuable insights for those interested in the diverse Francophone dimension of multicultural Australia. Particularly enriching are Lisa Lowe's examination of "Literary Nomadics" (in South-east Asia and North Africa) and Françoise Lionnet's essay, "Créolité in the Indian Ocean: Two Models of Cultural Diversity", which explores and contrasts linguistic politics and multiculturalism in Mauritius and Réunion.

Having met Christina Stead in 1976, I was immediately drawn to Louise Yellin's chapter on the only Australian author examined in the collection. While Yellin offers a valuable analysis of the literature of exile and "the woman writer's oppositional relationship to the metropolitan canon", her essay fits less comfortably in a collection dealing with Francophonía. In the introduction we are told Stead "lived in Paris in the thirties" and Yellin, herself, tells us that the novel *House of All Nations* (1938), set in a Paris investment bank, was written in a language that was "turning into French", but we are left tantalized. There is no analysis of Stead's personal dialogue with France, the French or the French language. But beyond such a narrow criticism, the great value of Lionnet's and Scharfman's anthology lies in the reflections on human identity and cultural exploration offered by the exile, the *émigré* and the immigrant writers of this century. This is a fine collection.

Edward Duyker

Sylvania, New South Wales

Barry York, "Immigration Restriction, 1901-1957", *Studies in Australian Ethnic History*, n° 1, 1992, 74 pp., published by the Centre for Immigration and Multicultural Studies, Australian National University, ISSN 1039 3188 / ISBN 0 07315 1486 6.

This valuable publication deals with one of the most elementary sources of information relating to Australian immigration which, up until now, has remained unstudied. Dr York has compiled fascinating statistics of those refused admission to Australia from the compulsory "Annual Returns" required under the Commonwealth Immigration Act. The only complete set of these returns was held at the Bills and Papers' Section of Parliament House. Not all were published in Parliamentary Papers and, inexplicably, no figures were compiled in 1906 and 1925. Dr York, who is working on a history of the Dictation Test, asks several questions in his introduction (which is in itself a fascinating mini-history of the Immigration Act):

Who were the individuals excluded for moral reasons? Who were those kept out because of their political activities or views? How many people were deported, months or years after disembarking, because the [dictation] test was administered to them within the stipulated one year period (from 1901 to 1919), or three year period after 1920, or five year period after 1932? [. . .] Why were 132 Italians kept out after failing the dictation test in 1930? Behind the raw statistics are fascinating human stories waiting to be uncovered.

Dr York's historical tables from the "Annual Returns" also raise questions relevant to the history of Francophone Australia. Why were French nationals the largest group of individuals refused admission in 1940? According to Dr York's table for 1940, these twenty-one French citizens were deported under paragraph "ge" of the Act. Fortunately for researchers, in his introduction Dr York has published all the paragraphs under section three that defined a "prohibited immigrant". It is surprising, therefore, that the French deported in 1940 were persons in the "opinion of an [immigration] officer [. . .] of German, Austro-German, Bulgarian or Hungarian parentage or nationality, or [. . .] Turk or Ottoman race." One wonders whether they were excluded for anti-semitic reasons or because they were thought to be Vichy sympathizers.

The figures Dr York has published also yield valuable data on Mauritians, for they regularly appear among the lists of those denied entry and of "departures of coloured persons". And there are numerous references to New Caledonia which may one day whet the appetites of Australian scholars.

Edward Duyker

Sylvania, New South Wales

Anne Salmond, *Two Worlds: First Meetings Between Maori and Europeans, 1642-1772*, Auckland, Viking Penguin, 1993, 477 pp., paperback, Aust. \$35.00.

Two Worlds is one of the great works of inter-cultural exploration written in recent times. It is bold in both conception and realization, and the richness of Anne Salmond's scholarship blossoms further in Richard King's impressive design and layout. This is a book full of wisdom and which is also beautiful to look at and savour.

Those who have followed the publication of the "Early Eyewitness Accounts of Maori Life" series (see my review in *Explorations*, n° 4, March 1987) by the Alexander Turnbull Library Endowment Trust, in the 1980s, will be aware of some of the carefully planned stages in Anne Salmond's research. In order to examine the first contacts between Europeans and Maoris it was necessary to gain access to as many first-hand sources as possible. Translations of Dutch journals already existed and the records of Cook's visit were accessible in English. French records, however, had only been partially studied by New Zealand scholars such as John Dunmore. This was remedied through the efforts of an extremely talented translator, Isabel Ollivier, who scoured French archives and produced several volumes of translations that were published by the Alexander Turnbull Library. Ollivier, however, had no brief to provide scholarly annotations; her task was simply to provide raw materials, in English, for future scholars.

In the meantime, Salmond, with her intimate links with the Maori community and knowledge of the existing ethnographic record (including Maori oral history of the visits of early European explorers), steadily gained the resources for a balanced analysis of events between 1642 and 1772. She matched accounts which had previously been uncorrelated and

she used her own deep knowledge of Maori culture in an attempt to understand past actions and reactions. The result is a masterly exercise in historical anthropology. *Two Worlds* is a work of a great breadth, which examines the visits of expeditions led by Abel Janszoon Tasman (born in Groningen, not Friesland), James Cook, Jean-François Marie de Surville and Marc-Joseph Marion Dufresne.

Although I was deeply impressed by Anne Salmond's book, I felt there was a lack of depth in her historical portraits of the Netherlands in the seventeenth century and France in the eighteenth century. Salmond is obviously less familiar with these nations and their history. There is a certain irony in the use of Jan Steen's painting "The Tavern" as an illustration on page 66. Her caption tells us: "In Dutch taverns the customers drank together, played games, sang and flirted with the serving maids." To portray a dense symbolist like Jan Steen in such a superficial manner is reminiscent of some of the naive writings of European explorers on the Maoris! In fact Steen's painting is not a simple exercise in pictorial realism, rather it offers a moral warning of the dangers of gambling, drinking and illicit sexual contact. My grandmother often used the description: "Like the house of Jan Steen". It is still a common Dutch expression for immorality and mayhem. In this we have a cultural clue to the ethical concerns of seventeenth-century Dutch Calvinists perhaps as important as those which help us understand *tapu* in the classical Maori world.

Salmond has called Part V of her book, which deals with Marion Dufresne's tragic death at the Bay of Islands, "The Death of the Noble Savage". In recent years there have been a number of interpretations of Marion Dufresne's false sense of security during his expedition's sojourn in New Zealand. Salmond, like John Dunmore before her, argues that Marion was a supporter of the romantic notion of the Noble Savage through the influence of Philibert Commerson and perhaps the astronomer Alexandre Pingré. Unlike Pingré, there is no doubt that Commerson, Bougainville's former naturalist, was an ardent supporter of Jean-Jacques Rousseau's views. From the Isle de France, where he spent the remainder of his life, he dispatched a glowing portrait of Tahiti and the "essential good" of natural man "not yet degraded by reason" in a letter to his friend, the astronomer Joseph-Jérôme de Lalande.

Marion certainly met Commerson at the Isle de France (Mauritius) in 1770, at a ceremony organized to mark the arrival of a

cargo of nutmeg and clove plants. However, there is no evidence that Commerson discussed Rousseau's ideas with Marion on that occasion or that they had other meetings, as Salmond asserts on page 361 of her book. Nevertheless, since Marion hoped to sail to Tahiti, it is likely that he *was* briefed by Commerson. There is even evidence that Marion wanted Commerson to accompany him, but that the naturalist was given other duties.

Salmond's book has certainly enriched my understanding of how Marion Dufresne and his men breached local *tāpū* and placed great stress on a strife-torn subsistence agricultural economy, but I must disagree with the suggestion that the French commander was a woolly-headed romantic seduced by Rousseau's ideas. My own research has shown that Marion Dufresne was actively engaged in the slave trade, like his father before him, and that he brought slaves with him to New Zealand as domestic servants. In my opinion, this makes it very unlikely that he was a disciple of Rousseau, regardless of how much he later enjoyed the company of Polynesians!

No doubt *Two Worlds* will generate discussion on many other aspects of early European contact with the indigenous inhabitants of New Zealand. Its great significance lies in re-opening debate on events that once seemed clear-cut or paradoxically imponderable.

Edward Duyker

Sylvania, New South Wales

Philippe Masson & Michel Vergé-Franceschi, *La France et la mer au siècle des grandes découvertes*, Paris, Tallandier, 1993, 477 pp., maps, tables, illustrations and index. ISBN 2 235 02112 3.

This impressive collection is a French response to the celebrations which marked the 500th anniversary of Christopher Columbus' voyage. The editors have sought to provide an understanding of France's place in the maritime history of the sixteenth century. The contributors have reviewed France's role in exploration of the period, but also the influence of the new discoveries on the French economy and the nation's strategic perceptions. The century is clearly divided into two separate periods; France enjoyed relative prosperity until 1559, but was then convulsed by political and religious conflict. The rise of Calvinism, civil war and the

struggle to control the coastal towns were profound influences in sixteenth-century French maritime history. One also needs to remember that important maritime regions such as the Duchy of Brittany had only recently become part of France (1490).

The collection begins and ends with reference to the challenge made by Francis I, in 1533, to the Treaty of Tordesillas (1494) brokered by Pope Alexander VI to settle rivalry between Spain and Portugal in the New World. To gain a share of future geographical discoveries and conquests, Francis I needed an escape clause for France that would not seem at variance with Papal authority (which had already divided the world between two other Catholic powers). To Francis' satisfaction, the Pontiff declared that the bull of his predecessor "only concerned the known continents and not those which would ultimately be discovered by other crowns". France had papal approval to lay the foundations of her first colonial empire. The following year Jacques Cartier (1491-1557) set sail on a voyage which would lead to the French discovery of Canada. I was a little disappointed that the chapter by Christian Buchet on "Adventurers and Discoverers of the Americas" did not provide more detail on the actual voyages of Jacques Cartier and Binot Paulmier de Gonneville. In recent years Gonneville has been referred to by several scholars of eighteenth-century French exploration of Australia and the Pacific as an important precursor and source of inspiration for those who sought to discover the Southland. These scholars include John Dunmore, Leslie Marchant and Anne Salmond. Marchant, in his book *France Australe*, has built a whole, sometimes tenuous, thesis on the significance of Gonneville's voyage of 1503-1506 and his "lost" continent. Gonneville is known to have sailed to the southern hemisphere, but past scholars have been divided as to whether he landed in South America, Madagascar or even Australia. In this present collection, Christian Buchet mentions the suggestion of Madagascar, then declares that it is "now incontestable that the *Espoir* [Gonneville's ship] reached Brazil". He could at least have told us why.

La France et la mer au siècle des grandes découvertes is an engaging anthology, but it is perhaps more valuable as a reference work that one can turn to for answers to particular questions. It includes useful chapters on maritime vocabulary, marine ordinances, naval construction and sixteenth-century French naval books. It also includes important surveys of individual ports such as Nantes, Bayonne, La Rochelle,

Boulogne and those of Brittany and Normandy, together with biographical notes on French admirals, "cosmographers" and explorers; an interesting selection of original documents; and a summary and chronology by Michel Vergé-Franceschi (the new Editor-in-Chief of the Commission française d'histoire maritime). Among the original documents presented is a collection of letters in quaint Provençal regarding privateering. This is the only section of the book specifically devoted to a Mediterranean port. Because of their distance from the Atlantic, Marseilles and Toulon were far less significant in trans-Atlantic and East India navigation. Since this volume is devoted to the century before the great Dutch discoveries in our region, neither "Australie" nor "Nouvelle Hollande" appear in the index of place names. However, Philippe Haudrère's chapter on the first French voyages in the Indian Ocean provides some compensation.

My only real criticism of this fine collection is that although it includes good separate indexes for people, places, and ships, its lack of a general index reduces its ready utility for scholars with less predictable interests.

Edward Duyker

Sylvania, New South Wales

Susan Radvansky & Patricia Alsop, eds, *'Twixt Heather and Wattle. The First Minute Book of the Australian Literature Society, 1899-1903*. Melbourne, Monash University Library, 1990, xx-167 pp., paperback.

A work of this character would not normally have any claim on the attention of *Explorations*. However, it has a marginal connection with studies of the Australian reception of French culture and, more important, it represents a solid contribution to the effort to document the groups that shaped and directed concern with the past, present and future of literary, artistic and musical activities in this country. The latter point is properly made in John Hay's "Foreword" (p.v.) to the volume in hand.

The essential starting point was the donation in 1977 to Monash University Library by the Melbourne bookseller John Dean of the first minute book of the Australian Literature Society, which was incorporated

into the Association for the Study of Australian Literature in 1982. As one discovers from the editors' substantial "Introduction" (pp. xi-xx), this precious record of the Society from its inception on 26 July 1899 to 21 October 1903 had passed into—or remained in—the hands of a schismatic body that eventually took the name of the Literature Society of Melbourne. The details of an ancient quarrel should not bother us. Nonetheless, it is piquant to recall that the formal dissension began at a meeting on 5 February 1902 (pp. 60-61) at which A. E. McMicken, actively associated with Victorian libraries from 1886 to 1964, was elected to membership. Australians have been as prone as their cousins in the Northern Hemisphere to leave people—men and women—in positions of power or influence for inordinately long periods. Small wonder then that attitudes characteristic of the nineteenth century can still be alive and well among us. Such byways can easily be followed by readers with the aid of the "Biographical Roll" (pp. 95-154) consisting of "the names of all individuals and societies, together with some commercial enterprises," mentioned in the document, which is itself transcribed in full (pp. 7-87), although not according to the rules of diplomatic. There are nevertheless some portions present in photographic facsimile. Together with the illustrations (frontispiece, p. ii; pp. 3-6, 88-91) such extracts help to give the flavour of the Federation years. A brief "Appendix" (pp. 165-167) of extracts from *Table Talk*, *The Herald* and *The Book Lover* complements the basic material, and the "Bibliography" (pp. 157-161) suggests the range of the searching done by the editors.

Although some uncertainties remain concerning the history of both groups that grew out of the 1899 foundation, the results reported here certainly need to be absorbed into revised editions of reference works like *The Oxford Companion to Australian Literature*. Similarly, we need better bibliographical control over the printed ephemera produced by the Australian Literature Society. The *Australian National Bibliography 1901-1950* records only four items, and certainly not the *Catalogue of Books* for the library held at Furlong's Studio, Royal Arcade, Melbourne in 1919 (6 leaf pamphlet in printed wrappers—"1-11-19", "Price 6d"—in the reviewer's collection). The editors state (p. xii) that they have been unable to locate any of the relevant books, which often "contain on their title pages the Author's act of presentation" (1919 *Catalogue*, p. 1).

The tensions that lay behind the secession of 1902 went in many ways to the core of doubts about the existence and nature of an authentically Australian literature. Even those who, like A. W. Brazier, the leader of the split, wanted essentially to "transplant the best of literature and art to our Australian hearts and let them grow there, and there 'study' them" (p. 63), do not appear in this period to have referred to French models. James Smith was a member, but he chose to speak on Thackeray when he addressed the Society on 19 February 1902 (pp. 62, 64). The French interests of other participants like L. L. Smith were muted. However, the artist Theodore Brooke-Hansen, who had studied in Paris in the 1890s, reacted critically to a lecture by Brazier on "The Australian Atmosphere in Literature and Art" on 21 November 1900. In seconding the vote of thanks he "disagreed with the lecturer in his strictures on the impressionist school in painting" (p. 45). It was to be an almost isolated glimpse—apart from musical items at the meetings—of another world on the Continental side of the English Channel. Yet names like Castilla, Du Soir, Haase, Josephi, Journeaux, Kricheldorf, Meyer, Püttmann, Quong and Vogler are reminders that Melbourne at the turn of the century was a decidedly multicultural community and that this fed into an interest in Australian literature.

The task of editing and providing a commentary has been carried out with care. One or two literals or solecisms need attention, and the note on Cole's Book Arcade (p. 108) confuses the date of the closure of the business with the death of its founder. These minor points apart, this is a more than useful contribution to the study of the emergence of a national literary consciousness.

Wallace Kirsop

Monash University

Hélène Richard, *Une grande expédition scientifique au temps de la Révolution française: le voyage de d'Entrecasteaux à la recherche de Lapérouse*. Paris, Comité des Travaux Historiques et Scientifiques, 1986 (Mémoires de la Section d'Histoire des Sciences et des Techniques, 3), 376 pp., paperback, 250 French francs.

The word limitation on a review of this book that I contributed recently to another journal (*Archives of Natural History*, volume 20, part 1,

February 1993, p. 137) is an incitement to return in the present number of *Explorations* to H  l  ne Richard's account of the Bruni d'Entrecasteaux expedition. It is, in any case, a study that ought to be owned by all those who are seriously interested in the great French voyages of exploration in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. It appears in the same series as Catherine Gaziello's *L'Exp  dition de Lap  rouse (1785-1788). R  plique fran  aise aux voyages de Cook*, published two years earlier in 1984. Australians at large—not the readers of *Explorations*!—need to be reminded that not everything is written in, or immediately translated into, English, and that fundamental research on scientific expeditions in the Pacific is continuing to be done in various centres in France.

H  l  ne Richard's investigation was carried out originally as a thesis for the Ecole des Chartes in 1978. Various articles, some of them indicated in her "Bibliographie" (pp. 355-359), were drawn from her work. The ones most accessible to Australian readers are perhaps "Un cas particulier de l'  tude des autres hommes: les s  jours de d'Entrecasteaux en Tasmanie (1792-1793)" in Andr   Dommergues & Maryvonne Nedeljkovic, eds, *Colloque d'  tudes franco-australienne, d  cembre 1987. Actes*, Le Havre, Universit   de Paris X-Nanterre, 1989, pp. 89-97, and "D'Entrecasteaux's Expedition" in John Hardy & Alan Frost, eds, *European Voyaging towards Australia*, Canberra, Australian Academy of the Humanities, 1990, pp. 95-97 (English summary of a paper in French).

This is a classic monograph—sober, serious and systematic—based on the available manuscript and printed primary sources, which are carefully listed (pp. 345-353). The table of contents gives a perfectly adequate idea of the book's argument and structure. A clear narrative thread throughout does not stand in the way of the author's primary purpose, which is to examine the scientific results and significance of a voyage undertaken in the complex and difficult circumstances of the 1790s. Thus one of the three chapters on the organization of the expedition details the scientific preparations alongside the reasons for a venture that was much more than a search for Lap  rouse, and the commissioning of the two ships *Recherche* and *Esp  rance*. Similarly, the preponderant central section deals first with the many events between the departure from Brest on 28 September 1791 and the arrival of a tired, depleted and demoralized collection of sailors and scientists at Surabaya on 19 October 1793, three months after d'Entrecasteaux himself had

died. The following four chapters cover in turn the important geographical and hydrographical work accomplished, the natural history discoveries, the anthropological and ethnographic observations and, finally, the conditions under which the scientists lived on board and coexisted—not without friction—with the officers and crew. The final section, which is concerned with the fate of the scientific work, treats the messy end of the expedition in the Dutch East Indies, the straggling return of most of the survivors to France and the complicated publication of the quite voluminous findings. Substantial appendices (pp. 237–344), including informative lists of the full complement of each ship, are a valuable adjunct to the body of the text. Maps, black and white illustrations, and indexes of names and subjects are commendable accompaniments to a book that is relatively free of misprints.

Hélène Richard's synthesis of a very considerable amount of documentation is also an invitation to further research. The poor sales of Rossel's official account of the expedition in 1808 (p. 230, and letter of the Minister, pp. 343–344) provide food for thought for historians of books. In due course I hope to publish elsewhere a technical bibliographical article on the discoveries to which this particular led me in Australian libraries. This sort of stimulation is the ultimate achievement of a new monograph.

Wallace Kirsop

Monash University

Camera-ready copy for n° 13 of *Explorations* was prepared by
Meredith Sherlock as Technical Editor. The printing was
done by Monash University Printing Services.

Copies of Edward Duyker's *Of the Star and the Key: Mauritius, Mauritians and Australia* may be obtained from the author at P.O. Box 20, Sylvania, N.S.W. 2224 for \$9.95 (including postage). Cheques should be made out to Edward Duyker.